European Commission
United Nations Development Programme
International IDEA

Thematic Seminar
Use of ICTs in Electoral Processes

Procurement issues of Biometric Voter Registration - Study cases

Victor Margall von Hegyeshalmy,
Procurement Analyst, UNDP Procurement Support Office

Dunia Ramazani,
ICT Election Specialist, Joint EC-UNDP Task Force on Electoral Assistance
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agenda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>UNDP PSO Global Procurement Unit, operational support to Electoral Projects</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Biometric Voter Registration –Scope, Procurement Process and timelines</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Levels of Technological Introduction</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Practical cases: addressing procurement challenges</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Guinea Conakry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conclusions</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Global Procurement Unit provides support and conducts procurement on behalf of UNDP COs for capacity-related or strategic reasons.

- Focus on UNDP Practice Areas
- Usually initiated by a formal request from a UNDP Country Office or Project.
- Procurement based on UNDP Rules and Regulations and principles, including Best Value for Money, Transparency, Fairness, Open Competition, Accountability and Integrity
Biometrics Voter Registration
-Scope of procurement

- Voter registration kits (cameras, laptops, power supply, accessories)
- Registration and database software
- Duplicate analysis software such as AFIS (finger-print) or FRS (facial recognition)
- Training of operators
- On-Site Technical support
Biometrics Voter Registration
Contractual implications

Several parties involved, including
End user, Donor community, UNDP – Purchaser, Contractor/s, Sub-contractors

- Interactions
- Roles and responsibilities
- Sustainability of solution/registry
- Capacity building (starts by assessment)
- Budget
- Timelines

PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACTING
“Procurement is the overall process of acquiring goods, civil works and services which includes all functions from the identification of needs, selection and solicitation of sources, preparation and award of contract, and all phases of contract administration through the end of a services’ contract or the useful life of an asset”
**Procurement Process overview**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Procurement Process Stage</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identify needs and planning</td>
<td>RFP or ITB bid modalities used depending on items, services and solutions. Tender addressed to short-listed bidders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EOI advertisement and shortlisting</td>
<td>Requirement must be fully defined and tender documents to reflect it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specifications and RFP/ITB issued</td>
<td>Bidding period includes preparation of offers and clarification period to queries from bidders. For RFP/ITB formal receipt and bid opening.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bidding period and receipt of offers</td>
<td>First stage - technical proposals evaluated. Second stage - only financial proposals of those that passed technical evaluation (opened and) evaluated. Third stage - 3 best ranked proposals (based on tender criteria) invited for site validation tests.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-stage Evaluation • Technical • Site Validation Test • Financial</td>
<td>UNDP internal approval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP internal approval</td>
<td>Contract negotiation, award and management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contract negotiation, award and management</td>
<td>Above US$100,000 approval of two Contracts Committee srequired</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Orientative timelines

EOI advertisement and shortlisting

RFP/ITB issuance (once specifications are finalized)

Bidding period and receipt of offers

3-stage Evaluation, including SVT

UNDP internal approval

Contract award

Delivery period

3 weeks

3 days

5 weeks

4 weeks

3 weeks

1 week

6 - 16 weeks depending on quantity and complexity

17 weeks
From sourcing to contract award only (time buffers should be added)
Levels of Technological Introduction in data capture

**Data**
- Previous cases
  - Paper Forms

**Fingerprints**
- Ink pads
- Polaroid camera

**Photo**
- Digital camera

**Technology level**
- Low
- Medium
- High

**Previous cases**
- Afghanistan 2008, Tanzania 2009
  - Forms/OMR
  - Ink pads
  - Digital Camera kits

**Conakry, DRC, Zambia 2009**
- Digital kit – with computer
- Digital fingerprint scan
- Digital camera
Levels of Technological Introduction in data management

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data</th>
<th>Previous cases</th>
<th>Afghanistan 2008, Tanzania 2009</th>
<th>Conakry, DRC, Zambia 2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Paper Forms</td>
<td>Forms/OMR (digitalized after)</td>
<td>Digital format and voter card</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Physical files</td>
<td>Electronic Database</td>
<td>Electronic Database</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>None / Photo</td>
<td>Biometric Analysis</td>
<td>Complete biometric analysis</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Technology level:
- Low
- Medium
- High
How technological options affect Procurement

- Decisions on appropriate level of Technology (geography, volume, literacy, sustainability, cost, donors and end user views, etc.)
- Property of source codes of software
- Roles, responsibilities and influence (dependancy) of vendors.
- Number of procurement processes involved
- In-house development or external contractors
- Integration of civil and voter registries
- Timelines
- Contract management
Afghanistan 2008
Scope of the Assignment

Background: Procurement for Nation-wide Voter Registration items July-Nov 2008:

- Procurement based on LTAs
- And adhoc Procurement not based on LTAs, including Registration kits, Data Center Equipment, AFIS duplicate analysis
- Training and Technical support on biometric system at data center level
- Data Consolidation not included, responsibility of EMB
Afghanistan 2008
Scope of the Assignment – detail

Procurement based on LTAs

• 4,950 Registration Kits
• 4,950 Registration Material Boxes
• 5,500 Blue Boxes for Kits
• 35 Stationery Kits
• 59 Generators
• Communication Equipment (30 locations, incl. radio equipments, antennas, repeaters, etc.)

Logistic arrangements, including air freight – 7 charter and 5 regular- and sea/inland transportation

Adhoc Procurement not based on LTAs, but on ITB/RFPs processes

• 4,000 Camera Kits
• 9,000,000 Voter Reg. Forms
• Furniture (over 500 units of desks, armchairs etc…)
• IT Hardware (550 workstations, UPS, db servers, scanners, etc…)
• IT Software (550 licenses, diverse off-the-shelf software)
• Biometric Duplication Analysis System (AFIS/FRS)

Consolidated volume of approximately USD 12 mio
Afghanistan 2008
Procurement challenges

Time constraints: Urgent deliveries 10-12 weeks process reduced under LTAs to 6-7 weeks

Political pressure and inestability, processes cancelled upon advise and requested to reissue later

Uncertainty of requirements: Late changes in methodology, specifications and request

Number of processes to be simultaneously conducted and coordinated

Sustainability and compatibility of biometric module with EMB data center and resources

Logistics
- Weight, Volume and timelines limited choice
- Access to Kabul (Airport Traffic Congestion, Export Permits from China, Landing Permits)
- Unforeseen issues (Storm in Asia, Technical issues, etc)
Afghanistan 2008
Procurement Processes - Adhoc

- EOI(s) issued with only one week time to respond. Simultaneously finalization of specifications and ITBs/RFP
- Reduced bidding period, among shortlisted suppliers with proven capacity and previous experience (for most processes no possibility to provide samples)
- Prebid conference for RFP Biometric Analisys system
- Examination of bids in Copenhagen simultaneous with Technical evaluations (ITBs in Kabul) – 1 week
- CAP/ACP submissions under exceptional expedited conditions agreed in advance
- Purchase Orders for ITBs placed immediately after, in some cases preadvises to suppliers issued.
Afghanistan 2008
Procurement Processes - LTAs

RFQs to LTA holders issued with shortened timelines to receive quotes

Evaluation based mainly on price and delivery time, as per already defined quality standards/products under LTA

Purchase Orders placed based on the RFQ requirement and agreed conditions/quality levels as per the LTA.
## Afghanistan 2008
### Procurement Processes - LTAs

#### Delivery Plan: examples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lots</th>
<th>Procure Method</th>
<th>Procure Process Time</th>
<th>Supplier Delivery Time</th>
<th>Transit Time</th>
<th>Kabul Delivery Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Registration Kits</td>
<td>LTA</td>
<td>3.5 weeks</td>
<td>3.5 weeks</td>
<td>1 week – air</td>
<td>8 weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Registration Boxes</td>
<td>LTA</td>
<td>3.5 weeks</td>
<td>3.5 weeks</td>
<td>1 week – air</td>
<td>8 weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stationery Kits</td>
<td>LTA</td>
<td>3.5 weeks</td>
<td>3.5 weeks</td>
<td>1 week – air</td>
<td>8 weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication equip.</td>
<td>LTA</td>
<td>3 weeks</td>
<td>2-3 weeks</td>
<td>1 week – air</td>
<td>7 weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Generators</td>
<td>LTA</td>
<td>3.5 weeks</td>
<td>4.5 weeks</td>
<td>1 week – air</td>
<td>9 weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>8-10 weeks</strong></td>
<td><strong>4-6 weeks</strong></td>
<td><strong>2 weeks</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conakry

Scope of the Assignment

- Provide 1000 registration kits and IT set up (central data centre)
- Training of operators
- Technical assistance
- Consolidate data, AFIS duplicate analysis and produce voter’s list
Conakry

Procurement challenges

- Time constraints
- National counterpart with relatively low capacity
- Uncertainty of requirements
- Software rights – open source?
- Sustainability
- Responsibility of supplier – risk allocation
EOI published in UNDP website, UNGM, 2 local newspapers

11 companies were shortlisted and invited to submit a proposal (RFP) on 24 August 2007

3 proposals received by the closing date of the bidding, on 24 September 2007

All bids were evaluated as per the criteria outlined in the RFP, technically and financially. As considered all three technically compliant they were invited to the Site Validation Test
Conakry

**The Procurement Process**

**Site Validation Test (SVT)**

- **Purpose of the SVT:**
  - To validate the technical proposal and confirm that the solution offered will work in the local environment.
  - Reveal any weaknesses that needed to be corrected prior to implementation.
  - Provide an estimate of the number of voters that can be registered in a day, providing input to the operational plan.
  - From a procurement perspective the Test is a purely technical assessment.
Conakry
The Procurement Process
Validation test

Process:

- Each supplier provided four kits to be operated at two different locations for the test
- The operators of the kits were Guineans with no prior relationship with the suppliers
- The training of the operators were the responsibility of the suppliers
Validation test criteria:

- Content and methodology of the training
- Functionality of the kit, both the hardware & software
- Identification of multiple registrations of individual voters
- Generation of the voters’ list
Conakry

The Procurement Process

Approval Procedures & Contracting

Due to changes in quantities, bidders were required to confirm their unit prices

CAP/ACP approval received March 1, 2008

Contract signed March 27, 2008 in the amount of USD 6,800,000
Conclusions and Lessons learned

- Involve procurement as early as possible – already in the project design
- Ensure sufficient budget from start
- Clarify and manage roles and responsibilities of other stakeholders e.g. EMBs
- Initiate close collaboration between program and operations by early procurement planning process
- Be aware of constraints on operational aspects of electoral activities – no goods no election
Conclusions and Lessons learned

✓ Centralized procurement is effective to avoid local pressures

✓ Learn market structures (supply/demand/vendor driven)

✓ Planning should allocate good time for procurement process and include necessary buffers to reduce impacts of potential delays

✓ Pre-bid conferences for complex projects – potentially in the recipient country or neutral
Conclusions and Lessons learned

✓ Conduct adequate tests to validate the evaluation especially for complex products such as biometric voter registration & e-voting systems. Review samples of all sensitive materials.

✓ Contract management of suppliers

✓ Close follow up and communication with suppliers (either LTA or adhoc suppliers, including freight forwarders).

✓ Advantages of expert suppliers

✓ Quality standards to be clearly defined and monitored

✓ Consider Sustainability (total cost of acquisition, reusability, managing expectations, etc.)
Thank you